



Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act

New York City Regional Plan

Inventory of Sector-Based Workforce Strategies 2016

Regional Boards: New York City Workforce Development Board

July 2016

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND

History and Vision.....	1
Defining Sector-Based Workforce Strategies.....	2

Inventory of Sector-Based Workforce Strategies

Executive Summary.....	4
Key Sectors.....	5
<i>Healthcare</i>	7
<i>Technology</i>	9
<i>Food Service</i>	11
<i>Industrial</i>	13
<i>Construction</i>	15
<i>Retail</i>	17
Training the Workforce for Today and Tomorrow.....	19

BACKGROUND

I. History and Vision

New York City has been a national leader in sector-strategies for decades. Aligning employment services and trainings with employer demand and sector has been common practice in New York City's Workforce1 Career Center system – the local name for One-Stop Career Centers – for close to ten years. Communities across the country are emulating New York City's work building strong partnerships with industry to develop a talent pipeline that drives economic and community prosperity.

In 2014 New York City (NYC) convened the Jobs for New Yorkers Task Force. Charged with creating a strategy to expand access to career-track jobs, improve job quality, and foster a more cohesive workforce development system, the Task Force included businesses, organized labor, educational institutions, service providers, philanthropy, and government. Five months of intensive discussions yielded key recommendations to transform New York City's workforce development system expressed in the City's report: [Career Pathways: One City Working Together](#).

This report serves as the City's guiding strategy and framework – including the strategies for working closely with businesses to meet their needs and supporting individuals along an established route to stable employment with family-sustaining wages. [**The NYC Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act \(WIOA\) Regional Plan is aligned with both the City's Career Pathways report and the New York State Combined WIOA Plan.**](#)

II. Defining Sector-Based Workforce Strategies

The Regional Plan identifies a number of sector-based workforce strategies that are active in New York City. In accordance with the New York State Department of Labor's [Technical Advisory 16-5](#), the NYC Workforce Development Board (WDB) is using a very specific definition of sector-based workforce strategies, defined as initiatives that:

- Address the **needs of employers** by focusing intensively on the workforce needs of a specific industry sector over a sustained period, often concentrating on a specific occupation or set of occupations within that industry;
- Address the **needs of workers** by creating formal career paths to good jobs, reducing barriers to employment, and sustaining or increasing middle-class jobs;
- Bolster **regional economic competitiveness** by engaging economic development experts in workforce issues and aligning education, economic, and workforce development planning;
- Engage a **broader array of key stakeholders** through partnerships organized by workforce intermediaries; and
- Promote **systemic change** that achieves ongoing benefits for the industry, workers, and community.¹

This definition is more comprehensive than definitions that reflect a simple alignment of training programs to sector or occupation. Consequently, this inventory is not an exhaustive list of all *sector-aligned* programs in New York City; rather, it provides an overview of initiatives that satisfy all elements of the above definition.

New York City has a number of these initiatives outside of government, and rather than attempting to curate a comprehensive list, we defer to the work of the Aspen Institute, the New York City Center for Economic Opportunity, and the New York City Employment and Training Coalition, and the City's Labor-Management partnerships in the work they have

¹ National Governors Association Center for Best Practices, National Economic Development and Law Center, and Corporation for a Skilled Workforce. *State Sector Strategies: Regional Solutions to Worker and Employer Needs*. 2006.

previously done identifying entities that lead sector-based workforce strategies. Space would not permit us to provide meaningful detail on each of these entities. Moreover, New York City's Workforce Development Board has crafted a strategy that organizes these entities by sector and works with and across them to achieve local and state-wide objectives.

With its partners, the NYC WDB will continue to evaluate and update these strategies to respond to changes in the local economy and to build on emerging best practices in service delivery to support a vibrant and equitable economy with career opportunities for all New Yorkers.

INVENTORY OF SECTOR-BASED WORKFORCE STRATEGIES

I. Executive Summary

In support of Mayor de Blasio's vision for a workforce development system informed by, and aligned with, the needs of strategic industries across New York City, the Department of Small Business Services (SBS) will pursue several policy and operational initiatives to provide New Yorkers high-quality, in-demand sector-based training and employment services.

The City of New York developed Industry Partnerships with the goal of supporting the economic vitality of New York City through quality job opportunities for New Yorkers and quality talent for local businesses. Each industry partnership focuses on a particular sector and is designed to work collaboratively with a diverse set of stakeholders – including employers, community-based organizations (CBOs), organized labor, philanthropy, government, training providers and educational institutions – to support systems change.

In order to improve the quality, scale, and impact of industry-aligned training and employment services, the City of New York will leverage the expertise of its Industry Partnerships and work together with the local Workforce Development Board, the Regional Economic Development Council, NYSDOL, and key employer, education, and community stakeholders in order to advance the ambitious but achievable objectives of increased economic success for businesses, workers, and the City.

The success of any sector-based workforce development strategy depends upon the availability of education and training providers equipped to deliver high quality, industry-aligned preparation to job seekers with the resources at hand to pursue it.

To address both of these priorities, the City of New York will implement new and enhanced initiatives in the coming year with the goals of: 1) expanding access to sector-based in-demand

training for qualified job seekers and 2) improving provider quality with an emphasis in key sectors.

II. Key Sectors

New York City's economy is vast and multi-faceted. New York City's workforce development strategy reflects that diversity, and in the coming year the local area will support employment and training initiatives in a wide variety of sectors. However, particular focus will be given to six sectors:

- Healthcare
- Technology
- Industrial/Manufacturing
- Foodservice
- Construction
- Retail

Together the six sectors account for approximately half of all jobs in New York City. These sectors were selected through an analysis of scale, opportunity, and impact. The City selected the sectors using data pertaining to tax revenue, recent job growth, forecasted job growth, total employment, job multipliers, wages, and wage distribution indicators. These sectors currently offer the strongest prospects for economic mobility and mutual "employer-worker" benefits through job quality improvements.

The City's analysis revealed that **healthcare and technology** are both characterized by high growth, higher-wage, middle-skill occupations and solid job multipliers, with every direct job created in healthcare generating an additional 0.4 jobs, and each new job in technology adding 1.4 additional jobs. In addition, a systematic skills gap in hiring impedes growth in both of these sectors.

The **industrial/manufacturing and construction** sectors have lower growth projections, but these jobs tend to offer relatively high income while not requiring a high level of formal education. In addition, the City makes or influences a large investment in these sectors, and thus they represent a unique way to leverage the purchasing power of the City for the good of policy and the City's workers.

Finally, the **retail and food service** sectors are among the largest in New York City. They represent the entry-way to a lifetime of work for many of the City's residents, including young adults and foreign-born New Yorkers. Because service plays such a key role in business profit and competitive advantage in both sectors, human capital is critical.

A table with detailed labor market data for all six sectors is included here for reference:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Health Care & Social Assistance	647,060 (16.02%)	63,154 (11.04%)	\$49,519
Technology	291,000 (7.58%)	28,838 (11%)	\$82,160
Construction	132,557 (3.13%)	15,277 (14.02%)	\$74,086
Food Service & Accommodation	342,004 (8.16%)	72,169 (28.71%)	\$31,427
Industrial	517,430 (13.47%)	-5,286 (-1.01%)	\$70,831
Retail	344,084 (8.73%)	45,756 (15.24%)	\$38,903
<i>Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region</i>			

New York City will leverage all of its workforce assets, including Industry Partnerships, occupational trainings, and the Workforce1 Career Center system to support work in these critical sectors.

III. Sector-specific approaches

Healthcare

Phase of Development: Expanding

Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Health Care & Social Assistance	647,060 (16.02%)	63,154 (11.04%)	\$49,519
Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region			

Industry Partnership: **New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare (NYACH)**

Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

Industry Partnership Strategy:

The healthcare industry partnership, the New York Alliance for Careers in Healthcare (NYACH), has developed a Partners Council, which establishes a common agenda and set of activities. The Council includes the Greater New York Hospital Association (GNYHA), the Community Health Care Association of New York State (CHCANYS), the Southern New York Association (SNYA), the Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute (PHI), 1199 SEIU Training and Employment Funds, and the City University of New York (CUNY). Since its inception NYACH has re-aligned curricula and launched industry-informed trainings that have already connected more than 1,000 New Yorkers to new jobs or promotions.

Training Strategy:

In the past fiscal year, SBS and NYACH have enrolled more than 550 New Yorkers across six industry-informed training programs. These programs target the ambulatory care, acute care, home care, and nursing and residential facility care subsectors and reflect the changing workforce and training needs of local healthcare employers as a result of the federal Affordable Care Act and the State's Medicaid Redesign. These highly interactive and engaging, industry-informed programs include occupational training for Home Health Aides, Direct Support Professionals, Medical Billers, and Health Coaches as well as NCLEX prep for foreign-trained nurses and residency experiences for un- and underemployed Registered Nurses through the Transition to Practice Program.

In the coming fiscal year, SBS and NYACH will evaluate and scale successful programs as well as launch a series of new initiatives, including contextualized high school equivalency and English-language instruction aimed at young adults and foreign-born New Yorkers enrolling in Front Desk and Medical Assistant training, Certified Recovery Peer Advocate, and other mental health-focused training programs in line with the City's ThriveNYC mental health roadmap.

Use of Available Resources to Support the Strategy: Combination of WIOA, City Tax Levy, White House Social Innovation Fund, and private philanthropic funding

Critical Elements that Cannot be Addressed with Available Resources: TBD

Technology

Phase of Development: Expanding

Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Technology	291,000 (7.58%)	28,838 (11%)	\$82,160

Source: HR&A NYC Tech Ecosystem 2009-2013 report released March 2014

Industry Partnership: : **Tech Talent Pipeline (TTP)**

Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

Industry Partnership Strategy:

Launched by Mayor de Blasio in May 2014, the NYC Tech Talent Pipeline (TTP) works with more than 150 stakeholders to define employer needs, develop training and education solutions to meet these needs, and deliver homegrown talent for 21st century jobs across the five boroughs. These efforts are guided by an Advisory Board of 28 CEOs, CTOs, CIOs, and senior executives representing the city's top tech employers and a collective workforce of 40,000 New Yorkers.

Together with employers, government partners, philanthropy, training providers, educational institutions and community organizations, TTP has created a first-of-its kind assessment of the NYC tech landscape in partnership with LinkedIn, launched 9 industry-informed new and expanded training programs, realigned curricula for 15 academic and training programs, and informed the development of the Mayor's historic Computer Science for All initiative. TTP has

also formed an Academic Council, consisting of 15 NYC post-secondary institutions who have pledged to continue to work with the City and employers to further develop career pathways for New Yorkers in tech.

Training Strategy:

In the past fiscal year, SBS and TTP have enrolled almost 500 New Yorkers in nine industry-informed training programs. These programs test a variety of objectives, such as demonstrating the effectiveness of non-traditional educational paths (i.e. accelerated boot camps) in fulfilling high-demand occupations like Web Development, Mobile Development, and Server and Cloud Administration, creating access for incumbent workers without tech experience to fill entry-level Data, IT, and QA opportunities, and increasing the competitiveness of CUNY graduates through additional technical support and internships for local tech positions in software engineering. One of the most successful initiatives, the NYC Web Development Fellowship, has successfully demonstrated that young adults who are out-of-work and lack a college degree can be trained for and connected to high-paying jobs in tech in less than a year. Most of the programs support connecting graduates to tech jobs paying at least \$60,000 per year.

Like NYACH, in the coming fiscal year, SBS and TTP will evaluate and scale successful programs as well as launch a series of new initiatives, including contextualized high school equivalency and culturally-specific instruction aimed at young adults and foreign-born New Yorkers applying to enter Web Development, Mobile Development, and other tech trainings.

Critical Elements that Cannot be Addressed with Available Resources: TBD

Food Service

Phase of Development: Start-up

Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Food Service & Accommodation	342,004 (8.16%)	72,169 (28.71%)	\$31,427

Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

Industry Partnership Strategy:

One of the largest sectors of employment in NYC with sustained growth, food service in New York City is of critical importance but is faced with a sizable labor shortage of qualified talent in the kitchen and very high turnover. This industry partnership will convene an **advisory board of businesses representative of the various sub-sectors of food service such as fine dining, quick service, and catering.** The board will help provide the input needed to craft new solutions for work-based learning, transparent pathways to advancement, and better bridge training programs to help the majority of the labor pool working in this sector but born outside of the United States.

Training Strategy:

Our strong partnerships with employers in this sector are built upon a history of finding and connecting thousands of talented, qualified New Yorkers to open positions. This has allowed us to gain a deep appreciation for employers focus on on-the-job training in this field. Our training

strategy for the coming year will be to work with those employers to develop new and innovative form of training that combine work-based learning with the necessary classroom skills and certificates (including the Food Handlers certificate). A particular focus will be foreign-born New Yorkers, who comprise the majority of some occupations in this sector. Lastly, this sector has a tradition of moving people up and through career ladders, but not necessarily in a linear or easy-to-understand fashion. The Industry Partnership will create bridge programs and educational opportunities that better educate both incumbent workers and prospective employees about career paths in the sector and how to best navigate them.

Critical Elements that Cannot be Addressed with Available Resources: TBD

Industrial

Phase of Development: Start-up

Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Industrial	517,430 (13.47%)	-5,286 (-1.01%)	\$70,831

Source: NYSDOL 2009 and 2013 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

Industry Partnership Strategy:

While jobs in the Industrial sector have contracted over the past two decades in New York City, recent data demonstrates that over the last five years the city's manufacturing sector has actually grown by 3,900 jobs, including 1,100 jobs in the last twelve months*. There are not high educational barriers in this sector (compared, for example, with tech or healthcare), yet many New Yorkers lack an awareness of jobs in this sector. Employers have reported a challenge in finding and attracting entry-level candidates. Furthermore, data shows that due to an aging workforce, expert roles are staying vacant for longer and retirement ages are increasing dramatically.

Because this sector is so heavily zoned in New York City, the **Industry Partnership** has begun to develop a place-based strategy that recognizes clusters of sub-sectors in specific communities (i.e. automotive manufacturing in the Bronx, etc.). The **Industrial Partnership will convene advisory boards aligned with local NYC Industrial Business Zones and clusters of businesses that**

have similar foci. These boards will work with the Industry Partnerships to determine core competencies required for entry-level jobs and better communicate them to qualified New Yorkers. The boards will also work with the Industry Partnership to design solutions to support the up-skilling of current entry level workers and the transition of deep technical skill/knowledge from one generation of worker to another.

Training Strategy:

SBS has enrolled more than 600 New Yorkers in eight industry-informed training programs in industrial sectors. This includes a variety of sub-sectors, such as manufacturing, transportation, and wholesale trade.

Based on business demand, SBS supported entry-level training in occupations, such as Welding, Commercial Driving, Woodworking, and Cable Installation. There have also been significant investments aimed at better serving target populations, including the City's industrial and transportation-focused Career and Technical Education high school students for entry-level work, line staff for promotion within industrial businesses, and Sandy-impacted residents for construction opportunities. Further, SBS has aligned its workforce programs with green building initiatives, led by the Mayor's Office of Sustainability, that provide training that leads to employment for workers and reduces energy usage across New York City.

* Source: https://nycfuture.org/pdf/Making_It_Here_July_2016.pdf

Critical Elements that Cannot be Addressed with Available Resources: TBD

Construction

Phase of Development: Start-up

Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Construction	132,557 (3.13%)	15,277 (14.02%)	\$74,086

Source: NYSDOL 2009 and 2013 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

Industry Partnership Strategy:

Job growth in Construction continues to outpace most other sectors in New York City and represents an opportunity for many mid-level jobs at family-sustaining wages while not requiring high educational attainment. The **Construction Industry Partnership will create an advisory board of construction firms and unions representing organized labor and other local stakeholders. The advisory board will help shape solutions** for the following workforce challenges in the sector: equity of access to career pathways in the unionized skilled trades; safety; and up-skilling. The Industry Partnership will also work with sector stakeholders to re-imagine/re-brand the image of the industry to attract a greater diversity of workers, including younger workers.

In addition, the **Construction Industry Partnership will advise and guide the Hire NYC Development initiative.** Hire NYC is New York City's commitment to leverage its purchasing power and investments generally, in the case for construction and real estate developments to

provide better access to jobs associated with these projects for New Yorkers. HireNYC will provide free, high-quality recruitment services to vendors and businesses filling open positions through City contracts and development projects.

Training Strategy:

In the coming fiscal year, SBS plans to support additional occupational trainings in Computer-Aided Design (CAD) and Computer-Aided Manufacturing (CAM), as well as to align current training program offerings with pre-trainings or bridges that will support access for additional New Yorkers with low literacy or limited skills to high-demand career paths. In addition, SBS will develop with the Industry Partnership new trainings based upon changes in the technical landscape and reflecting best practices international in design and build that will increase: construction project efficacy and completion times; clear projections of labor talent needed; and job quality.

Critical Elements that Cannot be Addressed with Available Resources: TBD

Retail

Phase of Development: Pre-Launch

Workforce Demand:

Sector	# of Jobs (% of NYC Employment)	Four-Year Job Growth (% Change)	Average Wage
Retail	344,084 (8.73%)	45,756 (15.24%)	\$38,903

Source: NYSDOL 2010 and 2014 Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) for the New York City Region

Relevance to REDC and WIOA Priorities: Building partnerships, demand-driven approach, emphasis on closing the skills gap to support growing industries and support upward mobility.

Industry Partnership Strategy:

The scope of the retail partnership includes national/international chains with a wide range of products (department or general merchandise stores), national/international specialty chains (appliances and electronics, office supplies, etc.), small specialty chains, and small independent specialty stores. This requires a diverse set of strategies. To engage decision-makers and leaders at the national/international levels, New York City will partner with other large cities and leverage our collective buying power to establish a national council. This group will focus on workforce issues in the retail sector, including working with employers, industry associations, workers, and advocacy groups, to establish a clear and accurate picture of employer demand, job experience required, and career pathways. It will also identify and support hiring/staffing practices in the retail sector that result in a benefit to the business and improve job experience and maximize income for workers.

Since many entry level jobs in retail are part-time and minimum wage, job quality will be central to the retail industry partnership approach. As an example of how this strategy may be implemented, the Workforce1 Career Center system has been working with retailers and businesses in other sectors to encourage living-wage jobs by only referring qualified candidates to jobs paying at least \$13.40 per hour for part-time work.

Training Strategy:

The training strategies in retail will include creating formal paths for advancement, supporting equity of access to advancement opportunities, and a model for understanding skills applicable inside and outside of the sector. Lastly, a significant aspect of the training will focus on “professional identity” training, such as handling absences professionally, negotiating for hours/salary, and presenting employment history most effectively.

Critical Elements that Cannot be Addressed with Available Resources: TBD

IV. Training the Workforce for Today and Tomorrow

The NYC Department of Small Business Services (SBS) and the Industry Partnerships work with a diverse set of stakeholder partners as well as the latest labor market data, analyses and forecasting to identify sector-specific workforce challenges that can be addressed with industry-informed training programs. These training programs are piloted by SBS and its Workforce1 system, the City University of New York (CUNY) and its colleges, other for-profit and not-for-profit training providers, community-based organizations, unions, and key employer partners to test their effectiveness as solutions to these challenges. The evaluation of outcomes from these programs are also used to identify opportunities for scaling and sustaining successful models that align with the unique mission and vision of each Industry Partnership and provide the greatest systematic impact for New Yorkers with barriers to employment or advancement and high-road employer partners alike.

Stakeholders are engaged in a variety of ways to shape these training program models. Some of these ways include, but are not limited to, confirming labor market trends, selecting occupational or programmatic focuses, aligning and enhancing curriculum and instructional models with current and future hiring needs, developing robust participant assessments, serving as hosts for interviews, internships or site visits, supporting industry exposure for participants, committing to hiring graduates, and serving as an advocate of programs and participants.

The training program models designed by Industry Partnerships and implemented by SBS are often certification-based trainings in growing or changing occupations offered in a cohort format or through an Individual Training Grant with a single training provider, but they may also include internships and externships, on-the-job training, incumbent workers training (through SBS' Customized Training Program), or other work-based learning approaches depending on the sector-based challenge. Across all models developed by the Industry Partnerships and SBS, those that are most successful often include some, if not all, of the following elements:

- Industry-informed assessments and curriculum and adult-centered instructional models in both technical and professional skill building,
- Paid work-based learning elements built into the program for participants to gain relevant professional experiences that allow them to earn while they learn,
- Early commitments to screen and hire graduates by employer partners, often prior to participant enrollment in training programs,
- Recruitment and business development support from the Workforce1 system, Industry Partnership, and/or other partners,
- Continuous academic, candidacy, and supportive services for participants during training and through attachment to the workforce,
- Employment-focused standards for successful training completion, including receipt of all industry-recognized certifications or Human Resource requirements for job entry,
- Performance-based contracts that incentivize high levels of completion and employment (i.e. 90 percent completion and 75 percent connection to employment with three months for provider's to obtain full reimbursement),
- Feedback loops from industry to SBS, the Industry Partnerships, and other partners on the competitiveness and readiness of graduates and new hires to succeed in the careers for which they are being trained to enter and advance, and
- Buy-in from all partners to the value of the Industry Partnerships and training programs to ensure sustainability of practice and continuous improvement beyond local, state, federal, and private investment.

Additional Program Development and Strategic Planning

In addition to supporting expanded and enhanced versions of the training programs that were offered in fiscal year 2016, in 2017 SBS and the Industry Partnerships will design and launch new trainings in food service and accommodations, media and entertainment, and retail. A key focus within the sector-based trainings in 2017 will be aligning work with other City agencies aimed at serving young adults, foreign-born New Yorkers, and other individuals facing barriers to employment or advancement. Most immediately, SBS and partners will offer contextualized

high school equivalency and English-language (and other culturally-specific) instruction for New Yorkers as they pursue training, certification, and employment in all of the Career Pathways sectors.